



PHILIPP FELDHEIM, INC.

96 EAST BROADWAY
NEW YORK, 10002, N. Y.

THESE

and

THOSE ...

By
Rav S. Schwab

© Copyright 1966, by
S. SCHWAB

Published by:

PHILIPP FELDHEIM, Inc.
96 East Broadway
New York, N. Y. 10002

Printed in Israel

Table of Contents

The Dilemma	7
Torah Without Embellishments	9
"Mensch — Yisroel"	13
Some T.I.D.E. arguments	17
Torah Only arguments	21
T.I.D.E. counter-arguments	25
Torah Only counter-arguments	33
Epilogue	38
Postscript	43

* * *

The highly respected author of these essays shares with us the spiritual leadership of our Kehilla. It need not be stressed that he is deeply rooted in the principles which form the character of our Kehilla. We need but refer to the brilliantly convincing passages in these essays which deal exhaustively with the so-called תורה עד"א precept of the "Hirschian school of thought" which, as the author proves, cannot be interpreted as a הוראת שעה. Permeated by the desire to do justice also to the other side, the author does not sacrifice one iota of his loyalty to the sacred principles which inspire our Kehilla.

These essays strive towards mutual understanding and mutual objective evaluation. May it be successful in achieving this important objective.

RABBI DR. JOSEPH BREUER

בס"ד :

ודבר בעתו מה טוב (משלי ט"ו, כ"ג)

This essay, which contains a series of dialogues, and an epilogue, should be read as a whole. We bespeak the attentive reader not to draw any conclusions until he has read the entire booklet. The debate could have continued on and on, with more and more arguments begetting still more and more counter-arguments. Even those prolonged discussions could not have changed the conclusions reached in the end.

These dialogues are echoes of endless discussions amongst our searching youth. We have attempted to recapture many of the pros and cons which were actually overheard and mentally recorded.

We release this essay with the fervent prayer that it may not be misunderstood, and that its author be judged with the "scales of merit."

יהי רצון שתעמידנו בקרן אורה
ולא תעמידנו בקרן השכה
ולא ידוה לבנו
ואל יחשכו עינינו (ברכות י"ז)

שמעון שוואב

נוא יאָרק, כ"ז טבת תשכ"ז

The Dilemma

The serious Torah student in America today is confronted with two conflicting viewpoints.

One: the formerly Eastern European ideal of exclusive Torah study, neglecting all secular disciplines and pursuits which we may call the "Torah Only" principle.

The other: the formerly Western European (Hirschian) Weltanschauung which combines Torah study with the "ways of the earth," commonly called "Torah im Derech Erets" (T.I.D.E.). While the first viewpoint is shared today by a great many of the Roshe Yeshivah and — for slightly different reasons — by most of the chassidic leaders — the latter opinion has been adopted by a majority of observing Jews in our time — mostly for practical reasons.

Translated into contemporary terms, this means that our high school graduates are given a choice either to continue their Torah studies in a full Yeshiva program that envisages a way of life which puts a premium on constant "learning" and which requires the total immersion of the student in the "Sea of the Talmud." The alternative would be to combine a daily Yeshiva schedule with part time classes in a college or other schools.

In awareness of this alternative, and in preparation thereof, the young students attend either a high school which stresses excellence in secular studies as much as in לימודי קודש or else an institution where the secular program, reduced to the absolute minimum, is grudgingly taken in stride and absolved without enthusiasm and without fanfare. The choice is made by our young people with or

without the consent of their parents and will depend on their teachers, environments and sundry emotional intangibles.

It is oftimes felt that a full clarification of this problem is called for. A meaningful debate between the two schools of thought is still outstanding, for it seems obvious that neither side is sufficiently aware of the correct opposite view and of all its motivations.

We propose herewith once and for all, a frank and open discussion of the basic ideological and methodical differences. Both sides should be encouraged to reason together, to pose questions and counter questions — all in a spirit of respectful inquiry without undue haste and without prejudice.

In this spirit we wish to present an unbiased confrontation of the conflicting views in the earnest hope that such an effort will not be a disservice to the sacred cause to which we are all committed.

Clarification of an issue has never weakened the truth inherent in either side of the arguments. He who is strong in his conviction is even strengthened by the clear exposition of the opposite viewpoint. He who is strong in his conviction will welcome an open discussion based on mutual respect for the opponent's opinion. Mutual intolerance betrays mutual weakness. *Only he who is fully convinced can afford to be fully tolerant toward his opponent and yet remain adamant and stand his ground.*

Torah Without Embellishments

Let us first outline the exclusive "Torah Only" ideology. That means: not ... תורה עם nor ... תורה ו but TORAH, pure and simple! "Torah-Learning" for its own sake, as a form of Divine Worship, the ultimate road to Jewish self-perfection. The goal is maximum knowledge to be applied to a saintly life confined to the די אמות של הלכה.

Whatever occurs on the outside of the "four squares of Halacha" evokes not more than a mild interest, it is of small concern to the Torah-minded personality. Within the walls of the Beth Hamidrash burns a fire of holy enthusiasm. There is neither time, nor desire, nor room for any other knowledge, for any other non-Torah interest. For the love of Torah fills every crevice of the heart.

No joy, no sense of satisfaction is comparable to the passion of חשקת התורה.

The Torah Only scholar is impervious to the noisy hustle and bustle of a world which is not his own and of which he intends to forever remain a stranger. For was it not our lot since ever to remain alone amongst men and stay aloof of all foreign entanglements?

College education is at best an unforgiveable waste of precious time which should have been better utilized, and at worst a dangerous venture into the realm of heresy, frivolity and temptation. Irreparable damage to the Jewish soul — especially during the formative years of life — may be the result of an academic career.

The ultimate reward for the diligent scholar is גדלות בתורה which entails a dedication to Torah teaching on the highest level as a life long vocation.

Most בני ישיבה, however, who after a number of years realize that they will never become "Torah giants" are in need of some source of livelihood. After having spent their best years in a ישיבה גדולה some gainful occupation has to be chosen, one which does *not* require college training, preferably a teaching job in a Jewish Day School and/or afternoon Talmud Torah. Even those who do not intend to devote their life to religious education will wish to spend the first few years after marriage in a Kolel in order to enlarge and deepen their knowledge.

Correspondingly, girls are educated in Beth Jacob Schools in a spirit of affectionate admiration of such נפש לתורה. The ambition is to share married life with a Talmid Chochom, preferably a "young man" of the Kolel, for whose sake the wife is ready to forego most material benefits to which newlyweds are accustomed, in addition to contributing her earnings to balance the family budget. Second choice is to marry a former "Yeshiva man" who is engaged moderately in a worldly occupation attempting to spend a maximum quota of hours daily in thorough Torah study.

A number of "Torah Only" disciples do enter various trades and businesses while most of the professions are closed to them.

There is a clear understanding that even to function merely as a "baal habayiss," it does not suffice today any more to become only a יודע ספר. Profound למדנות is required to maintain the Torah-true integrity of those forced to earn a living in a non-Torah environment.

The "Yeshiva world" is filled with rare idealism, a sincere ambition to serve G-d with "all the heart and all the soul," and a sacrificial dedication to an exclusive way of life with its promise

of saintliness, and peace of mind. This disdain of worldliness is like a rebellion against the yoke of a decaying civilization which offers very little hope of salvation.

The Yeshiva life with its by-products: fervent תפלה, closely knit comradeship, joint experience of שמחה של מצוה, satisfies a deep seated emotional need. Its exclusiveness of outer influences is an outgrowth of an innate instinct of Jewish self-preservation within a hostile world.

Ideologically, this way of life is grounded in the conviction that we were chosen to function as a "Kingdom of Priests" which means that like the כהנים of old, we should, of right, not take part in most of the worldly pursuits in order to be totally engaged in spiritual interests. While this is not possible in practice — הרבה חרבה — עשו כרשביי ולא זכו — worldly activities become a necessary evil to be relegated to the background to play merely a secondary role in favor of the true essentials.

To learn anything outside of Torah must be definitely undertaken שלא לשמה, only for the sake of acquiring means to a livelihood. Secular learning can only be admissible as קרדום לחפור, a "spade for digging." It adds little to one's self-perfection. It contributes nothing to the rounding out of the ideal Jewish personality.

The divine mandate given by the Creator to mankind to rule the earth and subdue it, (i.e. to develop its resources, to discover the laws of nature and utilize its forces, to cultivate all manifestations of life on earth), all this was directed *only* to the "nations of the world" and not to Yisroel. "Civilization" or human domination and cultivation of raw nature is the task of all men — *except of Yisroel*, the "priestly kingdom." Their holy vocation is to serve G-d directly and by doing so eventually influence mankind.

The messianic and ideal relationship between Yisroel and man-

kind will have been reached at the time when all Yisroel will be regarded as paragons of saintliness, the universal pace-setters of moral behavior. Then it shall come to pass that men will consider it a privilege to take the yoke of worldly necessities from Yisroel's shoulder. They will be grateful for the permission to sustain Yisroel's material welfare in order to share in Yisroel's spiritual blessings.

ועמדו זרים ורעו צאנכם
ובני נכר אכריכם וכרמיכם.
ואתם כהני ה' תקראו
משרתי אלקינו יאמר לכם וכו'.

(ישעי' ס"א ה' ו')

“Mensch — Yisroel”

The second school subscribing to the principle of תלמוד יפה (אבות ב') postulates a different philosophy as the ideological point of departure. It starts out from the premise that the Torah must rule over all manifestations of human life. The earth and the fullness thereof are created for man, and the ideal man at his highest potential is what Rabbi S. R. Hirsch זצ"ל calls “Mensch — Yisroel,” or as the Sages formulated it: אתם קרואים אדם.

The divine task handed to Adam, namely to control the earth according to the will of the Creator, applies to all men in general, but first and foremost to Yisroel. We were chosen and separated from the nations of the world to become G-d's “first-born son” whose historic function shall be to lead all the other “children” to their Heavenly Father. The ultimate goal of Judaism: לעשות רצון אבינו שבשמים therefore will become the ideal of all mankind in G-d's own time. To this end Yisroel was constituted — not into a sect or a brotherhood — but into a nation established in its own land and endowed with all the manifestations of statehood.

There exists nothing truly human anywhere outside of the scope of the Divine Teaching. All is contained within the Torah and subject to its application. Nothing which the Creator has fashioned could escape the attention and the concern of the revealed Will of the Divine Lawgiver. The “four squares of Halacha” encompass the whole wide world, as the Sages formulated it: אין לו להקב"ה בעולמו אלא ד' אמות של הלכה בלבד.

This nation with all its material endeavor, and all of its intellectual strivings, is to become ממלכת כהנים וגוי קדוש, a Divinely controlled organism — unlike all other political, cultural and economical en-

tities, and subject only to the sovereign rule of the Torah. The Torah nation is to blaze the trail for all other nations to follow towards the universal messianic goal of free man's total submission to the absolute Will of the Almighty.

The object of the true Torah education, therefore, is to make the student conscious at all times of this divinely imposed task. To acquire Torah knowledge is our foremost duty, *because without it, we cannot function at all.* However, the prime purpose of all Torah study is its translation into conscious and enlightened Torah life — תלמוד גדול שמביא לידי מעשה.

At all times must the unchanging teaching of Torah be applied to the everchanging Derech Erets. All contingencies of human life varying according to time and circumstance — such as all of our actions, our behavior, our attitudes, our relationship to man and beast and our positions within Nature and History, — they are all subject to the jurisdiction and the evaluation of the Torah.

What follows is that the Torah scholar should be well informed of the "ways of the earth." The laws of nature and the paths of history should be known to him. He should be well aware of what happens in the world which surrounds him, for he is constantly called upon to apply the yardstick of הלכה and the searchlight of השקפה to the realities which confront us.

What follows is also that the greater the wisdom of Torah, the more mandatory it becomes that this wisdom is conveyed to the Jewish contemporary world in a language which our generation understands and which will draw nearer the searching youth, the ignorant, the estranged and the potential Baal Teshuvah, to a joyous acceptance of the "Yoke of Heaven." The Torah leader must be able to dispel the doubts of the doubter as well as to counter the cynicism of the agnostic. He must, therefore, speak their language masterfully in order to convince and to enlighten.

There is indeed a dire need for גדולי תורה, great Torah scholars, who devote their entire life to the study and the dissemination of

Torah. The Jewish world today needs many תלמידי חכמים whose life task it shall be to enlighten it and inspire it with the love and the fear of G-d. We are ready to accord to those "messengers of G-d" the highest respects and a loyal following. These are the "honorary" כהנים and לויים of today. Like the members of the Levitic tribe of old, they are to serve all of the other tribes and teach them the living Torah.

Yet — education and leadership cannot function in a vacuum. It becomes therefore mandatory to the present day "Tribe of Levi" to initiate and encourage an educational system which can serve all other "eleven tribes" as well, and that means the vast majority of our people. It becomes mandatory to the Torah-conscious educator — not to inspire fear of the world and hesitancy to meet its challenge, but rather, to fortify the vast majority of our youth to meet head on and thus overcome victoriously, the thousand and one pitfalls of professional and business life. Our youth must be inspired to brave courageously and intelligently the onslaught of scientific arrogance and the sensual poison masked as intellectual liberalism.

The divine purpose for which Yisroel was created can be served in every capacity, in every profession, in all human endeavors, as long as these are not excluded by the Halochoh.

At all periods of our history there were Gaonim — who commanded authority within and became our spokesmen without — who had added secular knowledge to their profound wisdom. There is a colorful roster of immortal masters such as R. Saadja Gaon, Rambam, Maharal and so forth, all the way down through the ages to the Gaon of Vilna. They all have successfully employed the so-called "outer wisdom" as the "spice mixers and the cooks" for the royal table of the Divine Teaching.

What R. Samson R. Hirsch זצ"ל propagated is not really the principle itself as much as its introduction into חינוך, i.e., the educational program for the Jewish school and for the growing youth.

This is the true חידוש which Hirsch initiated! There were always learned adults who had a positive attitude toward worldly knowledge which they acquired *after* they had mastered Shass and Posskim. Hirsch innovated a school program for *children*, starting from the elementary level all the way up to higher education during the formative years of life.

True, there was some תורה עם דרך ארץ in the olden days. It consisted of all day study of Torah with one hour, or (at most) two hours thrown in for Writing and basic Arithmetic. The program of Hirsch expanded the scope of the Derech Erets by adding the full secular school program to the curriculum. Ghetto life, with its restrictions and suppressions imposed from without, reduced the need for "outer" knowledge to a bare minimum. The Derech Erets of the post-Ghetto society required much more time and more attention.

The Eastern-European admirers of Hirsch accepted this innovation merely as הוראת שעה (emergency legislation) for the Western "Kulturzone" to stem the tide of assimilation, reform and apostasy. To Hirsch himself, the concept of T.I.D.E. was neither compromise nor concession; to him it was the ideal Jewish world outlook. Not a lessening of the "yoke," but rather a steep upward path. It meant to learn more and to study harder — not less — in order to reach the goal of maximum understanding of Torah, combined with excellence in Derech Erets. In his inspiring writings he stresses time and again the foremost obligation to make Torah the main object of study and never to forget to emphasize the essential (עיקר) above the non-essential (טפל). On the other hand, the secular disciplines which are the "Hilfswissenschaften" should, of right, also be pursued with religious sincerity for the "sake of heaven."

Some T.I.D.E. Arguments

Now, the followers of the T.I.D.E. principle have a number of objections to raise vis-a-vis the Torah Only school:

1. The lack of academic standing will lower the respect for orthodoxy in the eyes of the world — Jewish and non-Jewish. It will immeasurably add to the growth and influence of semi-Jewish, anti-Torah movements and philosophies.

2. The lack of secular education will deprive us of all effective means to combat irreligious tendencies in literature, press or other mass media.

3. The lack of secular education will make it very difficult at this time and age to find normal means of income outside the religious teaching profession. Most of the אומניות or gainful occupations — *one* of which a Jewish father is obligated to teach his son to prevent him from crime or dishonest dealings, are neither "easy" nor "clean," unless based on professional training most of which requires at least some academic education.

4. The lack of academic education will eventually result in the complete absence of orthodox physicians and psychiatrists. We shall be forced at the time of a serious crisis in our lives to entrust our health, yes, our very existence to agnostics and heretics from whom we cannot expect any appreciation of our complex halachic problems, such as כשרות, טהרה, סירוס, נפש, פיקוח נפש, שבת וכו', affecting the sick body. Just as little as we can look forward to any desirable psychological guidance involving the afflictions of the *mind* of orthodox patients.

5. The lack of orthodox lawyers and economists will force orthodox institutions and organizations to depend on transgressors

and violators of the Torah, on the learned heretic or outright atheist to become the spokesmen and wirepullers for holy causes.

6. All this means that even according to the Torah Only view, the discouragement of academic education becomes a גזרה שאין בה רוב הצבור יכול לעמוד בה. No responsible Torah leader would wish to insist on a mode of conduct that cannot be realized in practice by most of the people most of the time. Indeed, in America even the Torah Only side maintains "Mesivtoth" where the regular high school program is offered, *although this is not required at all by the law of the land.*

Does this not mean then, for all practical purposes, that the Hirschean school program, on the pre-college level, has been accepted by the most prominent authorities in America, because there is no other way possible?

7. Are we not in need of principals and teachers for these high schools, as well as for the secular departments of the elementary day schools? This is a question directed to all types of orthodox education. Even the most chassidic Cheder must teach the secular subjects as required by the law of the State. How dare we entrust our children to non-Jewish or non-Torah-true secular teachers and principals without encouraging the suitable candidates to obtain a teacher's license in order to remedy this crying need in the foreseeable future. (The same need exists for secular textbooks which are ideologically and therefore halachically admissible. Those used — unfortunately — today must be rewritten or edited under the auspices of G-d fearing and learned men who have a secular education.)

8. The discouragement of secular education will also eliminate the orthodox Anglo-Jewish Press and all orthodox Judaica in English from the bookstands which will only offer "apikursish" literature from now on. Or shall we be put to shame by a "yellow" orthodox press and primitive writings, in poor and faulty language, not edited by educated writers? This will only repel our friends, amuse the antagonists and convince nobody.

9. Science celebrates its greatest triumphs today. It dominates every practical aspect of our lives, whether we admit it or not. If we deprive ourselves of all higher education, every sophomore, every would-be scientist, will look down on orthodox Jewry with derision and contempt — a sad and sorry prospect indeed.

Nothing could boost the ugly spirit of wholesale כפירה, nothing could widen the sphere of influence of half-and quarter-Judaism, more effectively than our self imposed divorcement from the academic world today.

Why is it that the leading Apikursim prefer the old fashioned and secularly ignorant Lamdan to the orthodox scientist? There is some nostalgic affection in official quarters for the "Shtettel," the mystic Rebbe, the "yeshivishe" atmosphere. Heresy and non-observance have nothing to fear from learned oldtimers. But the Torah-conscious Jew with the up-to-date secular education is considered by the anti-Torah Establishment as its most formidable antagonist.

Let us not forget that Western-European orthodoxy in the pre-World War II era could look back on three generations of Hirschean disciples, among them an imposing list of Torah-conscious scientists, physicians, lawyers, secular teachers, merchants and industrialists, some of them quite accomplished in Torah-knowledge, all of them strictly observing Jews who were also conscientiously קובעי עתים לתלמוד תורה. From their midst arose some of the most militant spokesmen for an independent orthodoxy and for the supremacy of Torah in all arenas of Jewish political and communal life. These were the men who could be called upon to contribute their worldly acquisitions, their up-to-date scientific training as well as their literary, artistic and technical skills and talents to the sacred cause of upholding the influence and to defend the rights and the honor of Torah wherever this became necessary. Those proponents of T.I.D.E., especially the academic elite, were also leading in their scrupulous adherence to the demands of the Halochah. They were distinguished by their בקדוק במצוות even when it entailed severe

hardships. (A few examples: the unshaven faces on Chol Hamoed or during the periods of mourning; the hair covering for married women in addition to — and not instead of — the decent covering of all bare parts; the strict observance of the fasts by men and women alike; the punctual and regular attendance of daily services; the insistence on absolute correctness in all transactions and the emphasis on the esthetic performance of all Mitzvoth.)

10. It seems that in our contemporary society T.I.D.E. offers the only reasonable hope of spiritual survival in a turbulent world without divorcing ourselves from reality. It also offers — it seems — the only chance to the modern Jew and Jewess for a renaissance movement back home to the eternal sources of genuine Torah-Jewishness.

The Torah is not further away from modern man than it ever was from medieval or ancient man. Old-fashioned thinking and modes of behavior were just as foreign to the Torah as are their modern counterparts. And they are just as capable today to be subjected to the intellectual control and the rigid evaluation of the timeless word of G-d, as were the shop-worn worldly values of by-gone days.

Conclusion: If T.I.D.E. was essential to salvage our spiritual fortunes in Western Europe at the time of Hirsch it is a hundred times more essential — all over the world — today, especially for the five million Jews in America.

Torah Only Arguments

Granted —

The lack of academic education may result in the serious handicaps which were enumerated in detail in the last chapter. Those dire results ensuing from a negative attitude to T.I.D.E. may perhaps be unavoidable. This should be deeply regretted. But it cannot be helped. For, it is not a man-made principle to which we adhere.

If according to the opinion of such eminent authorities as R. Chaim Brisker or R. Baruch B. Leibowitz זצ"ל — to name a few — the academic engagement in secular studies is prohibited by the Halochah, then even the most justified objections are overridden by the clear דעת תורה which has given forth a final and authoritative decision. Therefore, all those predicted consequences are not of our making. We are really *אנוסים על פי הדיבור* and not responsible for the aftermath of our sacrificial obedience to the law of the Torah.

On the other hand one might be optimistic and cherish the fond hope that by virtue of our dedication to *לימוד התורה לשמחה* the guiding hand of Divine providence may avert most of the threats and dangers which allegedly lurk in the future.

Now we shall have to pose a few arguments of our own:

1. Secular learning has become today so highly specialized that it requires a major effort to master even a small segment of it satisfactorily. How much time could possibly be spared from an earnest pursuit of the sciences for serious Torah study on a side?

This vexing, practical problem escalates in the same measure that Science marches forward. Where would the required time be forthcoming which is needed for profound learning and research in the vast field of Tnach, Shass, Posskim etc.? With meagre and superficial Torah-learning we have not done our divinely ordained task.

What about the command "to meditate therein day and night," until one is able to know all laws and "answer without hesitation?"

2. The result will be that we will be left without גדולי תורה, that means a generation bereft of recognized בעלי הוראה and abandoned in a storm-tossed sea of ignorance, half-knowledge, confusion and ideological anarchy, without captain and without compass.

Only a super-genius with a photographic mind could at the same time become a universally recognized halachic authority and also be highly accomplished in all secular disciplines.

But most of the Torah Greats are normal men, albeit, men of wisdom who have had to concentrate their intellectual excellence on the Torah alone in order to become the profound scholars they are. The demand to combine wide erudition in Talmud and in the Codices with a scientific diploma is an unreasonable demand because it could be put into practice only by a few exceptional men. Today the probability to blend a recognized בעל הוראה who writes שאלות ותשובות, or a universally acclaimed Rosh Yeshivah who is famed for his שעורים with an orthodox scientist into one integrated Jewish personality is most unlikely. And this even our opponents of the T.I.D.E. side must admit.

We wonder: is not the lack of Gedole Torah a much graver danger in terms of our spiritual survival than the lack of orthodox academicians, even if one does agree with the pessimistic prognosis?

3. The Hirschean ideal was based on the sure hope that by leaving the Ghetto we had historically entered into the second

phase of the Galuth called ברית יצחק (Commentary to Vayikro 26:43). The humanism of the early 19th century was indeed a hopeful beginning. Civilization tended towards a rapprochement of the human spirit with the eternal truths. R. Samson R. Hirsch זצ"ל with all his foresight could not have divined the capitulation of German Kultur, the advent of Hitler, the downgrading of Western Civilization, nor could he have predicted the rise of Communism and the conquest of more than one half of mankind by the dogma of "dialectical materialism."

At the time of Hirsch the majority of Western Orthodoxy consisted of more or less "gebildete" merchants with a sprinkling of the academic professions. The overt appearance of the 19th century "Derech Erets" was seldom out of tune with orthodox ideology. Literature and the theater etc., may have been at worst a cause of בטול זמן but not pornographic displays, or hotbeds of perverseness and depravity.

All this has changed considerably today. There are today few bridges left between the Torah and the "Derech Erets" of the mid-sixties of the 20th century. While the Torah is invulnerable even in our fast changing time, the Hirschean interpretation of T.I.D.E. is not.

How about the "Derech Erets" of the Jew living in *communistic* countries even where the practice of religion is not forbidden. Is there a communication between Torah and communistic philosophy and practice? And is not the atheistic materialistic academic "Freedom of Thought" coupled with modern campus morality not also a form of "Derech Erets" with which a synthesis seems inconceivable? Can we really make use of 19th century solutions for our much more complex 20th century problems?

4. What halachic dispensation exists to engage in serious and involved studies of anti-Torah or atheistic material? Is not the

involvement of the Jewish mind with *אינינו* and *אפיקורסות* per se, sinful and prohibited, even if the student does not become harmed by the intellectual poison with which he establishes a frequent and prolonged contact?

Who has a right to assume that his "Emunoh" is really that invulnerable that he could be sure to always remain unimpaired and immune while facing the daily temptations of the spirit?

5. T.I.D.E. offers more immediate rewards and more tangible benefits, amongst them prestige and profit. Therefore, the burden of proof of non-materialistic motivations is to be placed squarely on the shoulders of the T.I.D.E. follower, especially since it is a fact that every so often the occupation with the "*טפל*" does overshadow the "*עיקר*,"

CONCLUSION: Surely by locking ourselves out from the secular world of learning, we may turn ourselves into a new Ghetto society — perhaps — but we have managed by the grace of G-d to survive two thousand years of splendid isolation better than the one and a half centuries of intellectual assimilation.

Jewish life without academic education might have its far reaching and serious consequences. But Jewish life without *גדולי תורה* would result in a fatal calamity. And we dare not stand idly by and shrug our shoulders.

T.I.D.E. Counter-Arguments

If you consider yourselves *אנוסים*, i.e. victims of circumstances beyond control, and therefore not responsible for the inevitable results following the general acceptance of the Torah Only system, then those who consider T.I.D.E. a religious mandate are equally *אנוסים*, and not responsible for the absence of "Gedolim" allegedly resulting from our adherence to this principle.

One might argue that nobody can organize the production of "Gedolim" by design. "Torah-Giants" are not manufactured on the assembly line. True "Gedolim" are Divine gifts bestowed upon us from above, for "G-d does not forsake His people."

(Somewhere there may flourish one child in a thousand, a Wunderkind, endowed with prodigal mental abilities and with a driving passion to learn, and learn, without let-up. In that case it will be the sacred duty of wise parents and understanding teachers to accord such an extraordinary student an extraordinary education, different from the ordinary T.I.D.E. routine; to make sure that a potential luminary is not extinguished before it was given its chance to shine. This exceptional young scholar should drink *first* at the wellsprings of Torah knowledge which includes Tnach, Shass, Poskim, Halacha and Haggada to his heart's content. Afterwards come the "outer" wisdoms, easily absorbed by the mastermind and fixed on the periphery of his intellectual horizon. And, the community must foot the bill for his material needs, if parents could not afford to do it themselves.)

However, we are dealing with the 999 ordinary though talented pupils for whom the T.I.D.E. program means, in contemporary terms, to attend a Mesivta-high school, where secular knowledge is

studied in the afternoon, in addition to the main subject-matter which is תלמוד תורה and where maximum efforts are expected and rewarded in all disciplines.

After high school, the student is given a possibility to choose his career; business or professional, and combine his evening courses, academic or otherwise, with his studies in a בית המדרש which offers intensive Torah courses during the better part of the day. It is, in most cases, not too much of a hardship to do with fewer courses and fewer credits in college — which postpones the acquisition of the final degree for a year or two, but which assures a steady climb up on the ladder of Torah knowledge without overtaxing the mental capacities of the diligent student.

Every graduate of a T.I.D.E. high school should be urged to attend a full-time ישיבה גדולה *with an exclusive learn program for a few years*, prior to their other studies.

(We would wish that the graduate of a T.I.D.E. institution who enters for a few years into one of the recognized Torah-Academies would always encounter there the wise counseling of Torah teachers who would encourage the student to rise in Torah *without* abandoning the rock from which he has been hewn.)

2) If one considers the Hirschean idea outdated in our totally different age, then one must equally disqualify pre-Nazi era תשובות on post-holocaust שאלות. For everything is changed today. The שאלה with respect to T.I.D.E. education in America of the mid-century is totally different from the one which the late saintly masters of blessed memory answered. Were they alive today, they might render completely different תשובות.

One of the main differences is that the temptations of heresy and agnosticism are not lurking mainly inside the colleges. Every library, every corner bookstore (including Hebrew bookstores!) contains as much Apikursus as the lecture halls of a university. There are newspapers and magazines in English as well as in Ivrit and Yiddish obtainable everywhere which are filled with anti-religious,

anti-Torah dynamite. The forbidden fruits sprout everywhere, college or no college. The bright-eyed student is confronted with overt and covert כפירה wherever he turns. To ignore this shocking state of affairs does not minimize the acute danger.

On the other hand, T.I.D.E. education may forge the intellectual armour to beat the rebellious ideas into submission.

3) The propagators of T.I.D.E. must not forget to *emphasize* at all times the *grave dangers* which beset the way of boys or girls who leave the comparatively safe heaven of a Torah-true school. (Even to go to a simple trade school, to take up nursing, to work in a big office, or to be a salesman on the road is — in the literal sense of the word פיקוח נפש, i.e. highly dangerous for the soul.)

In our time where arts, pseudo-science and literature have made a mockery of the moral attitudes which were universally acknowledged only decades ago, everything is fraught with danger. It is very similar to the danger of driving an automobile or crossing a busy street; since very few could afford to forego riding in a car in order to avoid all possible risks to life and limb, we are conditioned to exercise extreme caution in traffic and trust in G-d to whom we pray daily for our safety and our very existence.

The same situation prevails in the realm of the spiritual risks which are part and parcel of living in the contemporary world. It would be criminally foolish to minimize the spiritual dangers which confront the student inside the university. He might be tempted to mistake a scientific theory for a proven fact. He might fall for the lure of intellectual freedom and "unbiased inquiry." He might become overawed by technological progress and might be tempted to worship at the shrine of materialism and focus his major interests on the external aspects of earthly life. Let us be honest to face this unpleasant truth.

Let us, however, also be honest to state that proper T.I.D.E. education is able to minimize those ugly possibilities to a very considerable degree. They are not eliminated though until the day

will have come when the T.I.D.E. system continues beyond the high school level. All higher education under T.I.D.E. auspices must be staffed by a faculty which is distinguished by אהבת תורה and יראת שמים and conducted along a curriculum approved by Torah authorities.

It is towards this goal our endeavors are geared.

4) We are concerned that the image of the Torah Jew should not be distorted. We should refuse to become branded as anti-intellectual "fundamentalists," who are to be pitied for their naive simplicity. We are extremely eager to gain in the eyes of the world the most respectful recognition for Torah Judaism, as well as an admiration for its leadership. For this Divine Torah is meant to be "our wisdom and our intelligence in the eyes of the nations..."

Anti-scientific pronouncements by halachic authorities may very well drive the majority of today's Orthodoxy into the open arms of those who offer some form of split-personality Judaism instead of real Yiddishkeit.

5) We are saddened by the fact that the American-bred disciples of the great Lithuanian "lomdishe" tradition seem to have forgotten the enthusiastic endorsement of the life work of R. Samson R. Hirsch by such men as R. Yitzchok Elchonon Spector or R. Chaim Ozer Grodsky זצ"ל.

At the same time do we deplore the self-pity, the inferiority complex of the former T.I.D.E. pupil who ever so often is tempted to throw sand into the well from which he has drunk.

We also include those ילידי אשכנז who all of a sudden become ashamed of their traditions and their time-hallowed customs. (By the way: we don't appreciate the sick humor of calling their G-d fearing parents and grandparents "Yekkes." The "Yekke" of today, like the "Pollack" of yesterday, belongs to the ugly pockmarks of a Golus mentality which became outdated some time ago. We are taught that "he who gives even one of his fellowmen a nasty by-name forfeits his portion in the world to come." How about him who

spits a summary insult into the eye of one whole segment of (כלל ישראל)

6) We would wish that all of our Torah learning youth mirrors in its external appearance the serene dignity and the princely noblesse which have always been considered the earmarks of true Talmidei Chachomim.

We earnestly wish that this image is not slurred by deliberate sloppiness and awkward mannerism which are not conducive to כבוד התורה. We look forward to the day when once again friend and foe alike will point to a Torah scholar with the classic words:

"Thou art a prince of G-d in our midst!"

(By the way, this was one of the accomplishments of the "Mussar Movement.")

7) While we do not urge that only "Torah-Giants" come forth from our great Yeshivoth, we are certainly not anxious to put up with any "Torah-Dwarfs" either. By this we mean the overly inflated semi-scholar, whose knowledge of נביאים and כתובים is nil, whose acquaintance with ששה סדרי משנה is pitiful, whose knowledge of הלכה is just as fragmentary as his knowledge of אנדה, whose encounter with השקפה literature is confined to 2 or 3 books but, who ever so often, nowadays becomes the self-styled expert on דעת תורה.

The few gallons of knowledge which such a one has drawn from the boundless ocean of G-d's Torah must not make him so arrogant that he could now assume the right to give forth authentic opinions in a field in which he is still an amateur.

8) Ours is a keen sense of sympathy with the diligent, but not exceptionally gifted student, who happens to be condemned, without pedagogic skill or know-how, to the torture of an unruly classroom as the only alternative to becoming a drifting "Luftmensch"... What sustenance does the Yeshiva world offer the pedestrian student who is not endowed with special כשרונות and does not happen to have wealthy parents? Would it not be irresponsible to recom-

mend him as a teacher for our children, who are certainly entitled to get the most capable educators rather than those who happen to have failed to become great luminaries?

We believe that the average Yeshiva students shall be trained to become *what the average Yeshiva students have become for the last few thousand years*: בעלי בתים ויראים ושלמים who are קובעי עתים לתורה to the very best of their abilities.

9) College education is by no means a condition sine qua non, although lately it seems to have become a fetich in American orthodox circles. It is only *one* of the "Derech Erets" possibilities which present themselves today to our youth in search of a gainful occupation.

The Torah's sphere of interest encompasses the entire Jewish nation, from the bootblack to the physician, the farmer as well as the engineer. Nothing admissible by the Halochoh is ruled out by the T.I.D.E. Weltanschauung.

10) It is also by no means a necessity that all of our leading Torah authorities would become accomplished scientists with academic degrees and honors.

It is, however, extremely necessary that they will devote sufficient time and interest to gain and gather a lot of useful and learned information that is needed to keep abreast of the up-to-date developments in the world of science and philosophy. They must be capable orally and in writing to communicate with their generation in a manner which commands respect. This open-mindedness towards the affairs of the world and its progress, the acquisition of adequate information on those subjects which are potentially valuable, is the indispensable equipment for a contemporary Torah authority in addition to his חריפות ובקיאות בש"ס ופוסקים. Especially if he is placed in a responsible position to act as a guide and counselor, or as a spokesman for our generation.

11) Since Derech Erets is in a constant state of flux, the relationship between Torah and Derech Erets is also subject to constant

revision. Positively there is no collaboration between Torah and outright כפירה ideology. Therefore, T.I.D.E. could not flourish within the framework of Communism just as it could not flourish in a concentration camp.

In our civilization, the relationship between Torah in theory and practice on one side, and modern art and literature on the other, becomes extremely difficult indeed. But as far as the Natural Sciences and Technology are concerned, the points of contact, within the framework of the permissible, are numerous. Also, the behavioral sciences and philosophy offer many possibilities, although some discrimination is called for.

12) We feel duty-bound to repeat that as long as we have not staffed the secular departments of our T.I.D.E. schools throughout with G-d fearing and Torah-conscious teachers, we dare not sleep nor slumber, nor rest on our laurels. Fortunately, there are enough teachers who could fill the bill. But unfortunately, there are not enough "bills" to financially secure their employment.

As long as — because of financial inadequacies — the T.I.D.E. schools still have to hire "other" teachers, our purpose has not as yet been *properly* fulfilled.

13) R. Samson R. Hirsch did not send his youth to non-Jewish high schools. Instead, he founded his own Realschule. Why should we now have to urge our youth to go to non-Jewish colleges rather than to found our own?

We have, thank G-d already a number of Bnei Torah who can qualify as college teachers. Why not start a junior college for teachers as a beginning — with Torah-true instructors only.

Here is a truly historic challenge for a Maecenas who has been blessed with true wisdom in addition to great wealth. Only then could we gratefully and proudly proclaim that we have done justice to the ideal which inspires our efforts.

This goal is still far afield. But we must not rest one day until we have reached it.

Before us looms a vast Jewish wasteland populated by 5½ million of our lost brethren, minus the small Torah-true minority. One day we shall have to answer why we have abandoned them to their slow but sure spiritual disintegration.

Only T.I.D.E. offers the timeless and Divine Judaism in a way which can be emulated by American Jews today. Only T.I.D.E. speaks their language and, therefore, T.I.D.E. could pave the messianic road of their eventual return.

Let us summarize:

Our ideal is *not* what a few chosen individuals with lofty aspirations attempt to accomplish but what the Torah nation as such must accomplish namely:

לתקן עולם במלכות ש-י,
וכל בני בשר יקראו בשמך.

Torah Only Counter-Arguments

1) We reject the contention that only T.I.D.E. holds the keys to the hearts and minds of the spiritual strangers in our midst.

The enormous emotional appeal of the Torah-Only way of life has gained an ever increasing influence within the Jewish American youth today. There are strong indications that the original grass-roots approach of the old type Eastern European Yiddishkeit wins more converts amongst the estranged brethren than the synthetic and sophisticated Western approach.

The potential בעל תשובה is somehow more intrigued by the "Masmid" who "learns" while riding in a subway, than by the Association of Orthodox Scientists. The bearded Chabad messengers on the college campus can testify to this strange phenomenon. They are not ridiculed out of existence and very often they are taken quite seriously by the boys and girls whose Jewish background is below par.

There are other tale-telling signs of the times:

A large percentage of the older Yeshiva students come from non-orthodox homes. Some of the most ardent and most promising products of the Torah Only schools come from typical Jewish American families with sub-standard Torah knowledge and even lesser performance.

It is a strange phenomenon that some of the seemingly odd externals, like beards and payoth, the Yiddish vernacular, the chassidic melodies, etc., appear to have a peculiar magnetism all of their own. They oftentimes appeal to the modern Baal Teshuvoh more than the well edited English Torah Journal with its high-class editorials.

We realize that mere emotionalism or youthful preference for the exotic is no substitute for clear thinking and realistic evaluation. But, the former may eventually lead to the latter.

Has T.I.D.E. made inroads into the Torah-less Jewish American society as conspicuous as those of Torah Only?

Has T.I.D.E. found an emotional response amongst the new generation which equals the enthusiasm of the Torah Only adherents?

2) The Torah Only schools in America have already brought forth their own perpetuators, all in less than 25 years. We have already our own American born and bred young Roshe Yeshivah who have founded Yeshivoth of their own, who have published חדושי תורה וספרי הלכה of their own.

We ask: is there any evidence for such vitality and such missionary zeal in the American T.I.D.E. camp?

3) In all our vast Mussar literature (including the classic books of Hirsch, such as his commentary on Chumash and Tehillim, as well as Chorev and 19 Letters), we find the inspiration to continue our own Torah Only way of life. For instance: S. R. Hirsch teaches us to throw away the crutches of Greek philosophy and all theosophical speculation, to do without semitic philology when studying T'nach, to be unconcerned with apologetical refutations of biblical criticism, to be disinterested in theological arguments and logical proofs of the existence of G-d and so forth. To Hirsch, all is sheer Emunoh and passionate conviction beyond peradventure.

Our total dedication to Torah Only without apology and without deference to the sensibilities of the antagonists, and without concern for possible repercussions, is nourished by the Hirschean writings.

4) We fail to find in Hirsch, neither the urgent insistence to "go to college," nor the condemnation of those who neglect the Derech Erets in favor of exclusive Torah learning.

And we have the strong feeling that were Hirsch to rise today and were he to scan the Jewish American horizon, and were he to behold the holy fervor and the self-sacrificial חשקת התורה which

has gripped a spiritual elite of American born young men and women, he would be the leading advocate of a wholehearted approval of such a miraculous Torah renaissance by a chosen group of pioneers.

His banner of T.I.D.E. — he would hoist *not for us*, but for the slumbering souls of the remaining 95% of American Jewry — who are in sore need of a speedy awakening. He would gladly leave the Torah Only students to their sacred labor in the vineyards of Torah and Mussar, if we have read his words properly.

(By the way: we do not agree that until a little over 100 years ago, when S. R. Hirsch published his classic books, Judaism had not been adequately understood. We do not share the belief that all genuine Jewish Weltanschauung begins and ends with Hirsch.

The T.I.D.E. student who relegates all מפרשי התורה into the background in favor of the one and only Commentary par excellence, does a disservice to the memory of the author of this Commentary. The exclusive concentration on Hirsch reduces the boundless ocean of Divine wisdom to the definitions of one great mind. We believe that the inclusion of Hirsch into the historic honor roll of our גדולי הדורות as one great man amongst many other masters, elevates Hirsch's genius to its true significance.)

We do resent the glorified Am Haaretz who is not too particular in his Jewish performance, who condones the very aberrations which Hirsch condemned, viz.: religious nationalism, orthodox-reform collaboration, neutral Judaism, etc.; whose sympathies are with the "Department Store Academy," where Brisk and Slabodka are offered on the first floor, and Graetz and Dubnow on the second. When such a person takes Hirsch's name in vain, wielding T.I.D.E. like a weapon against recognized Torah scholars and against recognized Torah schools he becomes somewhat ridiculous.

What a travesty!

S. R. Hirsch, who was the warrior without compromise against those who hated the Torah, has to let his blessed memory be invoked today against those who love the Torah.

5) One often overlooks another simple fact: Before the holocaust there was a reservoir of Torah Only Yiddishkeit in Eastern Europe from which Western Orthodoxy was able to draw and to draw freely. Today this reservoir has run dry. Our intellectual Torah life is a disaster area.

Is there another reservoir which can be tapped now? Would it not be everyone's concern, not the least the concern of the T.I.D.E. followers, to replenish the reservoir with all deliberate dispatch and energy?

The Kolalim, which are Torah Only schools for married men, are an attempt to rebuild the broken cisterns of the past, to combat the imminent danger of spiritual drought in our day. Is it not everybody's responsibility to encourage this life saving endeavor with zeal and devotion?

6) One final thought before we rest our case. The sincere T.I.D.E. scholar should have a special interest in the existence of the Torah Only school for the following reason:

Suppose, the occupation with secular philosophy had tainted imperceptibly the indigenous purity of genuine Torah thinking. Suppose, the invasion of foreign ideas had beclouded the genuine and original Jewish predispositions and attitudes. Subconsciously, the inner directions could have changed ever so lightly. Who would ever find it out? It is the Torah Only scholar who would be quick to notice a deviation from the genuine pattern. His reaction would be to call immediate attention to the slightest foreign intrusion.

All those who need a reliable compass for the windy passage through unchartered seas of Jewish Weltanschauung should welcome the Torah Only school for this reason alone, as a soundingboard and a testing-ground for creative Jewish thinking today.

Let us summarize too:

Our ideal is not a time-bound concession the multitude cannot do without, our ideal is what a chosen elite has the courage to do: to divorce itself from all mundane constrictions and dedicate itself

totally to Torah Only. With the unfettered לשמח התורה we rise above all lowly entanglement, for fortunately, the Torah is not "in Golus."

We do not advocate our Torah Only ideology to all without discrimination, but we certainly propagate that our slim ranks be swelled with many of the most idealistic young men and women which we can muster here and now. You do not have to encourage every available recruit to join our ranks. But to discourage a potential Talmid Chochom from testing his possibilities in the Torah Only world, is this מה שהשם שואל מעמך?

We wonder.....

There was once a time in ancient Yisroel of which the prophet tells us: "I raised some of your children to become נביאים and some of your young sons to become נזירים but you made the נזירים to drink wine and you commanded the נביאים not to prophesy (Amos 2).

We wonder.....

Epilogue

We are standing at the crossroads. Who is right and who is not? Many of the arguments remain unanswered on both sides. Both schools of thought are striving to do justice to their consciences and their deep seated convictions. If there ever was a שם שמים מחלוקת לשם שמים in our time — this is it. We experience in our generation another aspect of that הסתרת פנים which so distinguishes *this* Golus night from all other nights.

Certainly, a number of questions posed by one side could be answered by the other and vice versa. But those answers would provoke further questions and so on and on ad infinitum.

Both schools would be able to quote any number of passages from our classic literature, from the sayings and utterances of early and latter-day authorities to substantiate their respective convictions for argument's sake!

As evidence for its concern with גדלות the Torah Only school could cite Rambam ה' דעות פרק ג' who formulates the educational *ideal* as follows:

וישים אל לבו שיהי לו בן
אולי יהי חכם וגדול בתורה.

This emphasis on "greatness" is found by our Sages (Ber. 31b) in a phrase used by Channa in her prayer for זרע אנשים [seed of men] which (also according to Midrash Yalkut Sam. I:1) connotes: "greatness" and "wisdom," etc. The T.I.D.E. school could quote the same talmudic passage (Ber. 31b) for the opposite view:

רבנן אמרו זרע המובלע באנשים: כי אתי ר' דימי אמר: לא גויץ
ולא אריך... לא חכם ולא טיפש...

which indicates that the *ideal* child is the normal and average child who dedicates his life to the service of G-d and not the exceptional "giant."

The Torah Only school could call attention to the fact that Rambam (H. Talm. Torah I, 12) pictures the professional man as one "who devotes only 3 hours to his vocation and 9 hours to Torah study" and then goes on (III, 5) to encourage the curtailment of the little time allotted to one's mundane occupation to the bare minimum and finally comes out with the following statement:

מי שנשארו לבו לקיים מצוה זו כראוי ולהיות מוכתר בכתר תורה
לא יסיה דעתו לדברים אחרים, ולא ישים על לבו שיקנה את התורה
עם העושר והכבוד כאחת (שם הלכה ו')

which means nothing else but the exclusion of all other interests from the minds of those individuals who strive for perfection in Torah knowledge.

The T.I.D.E. school could cite as evidence for its position another paragraph in the same chapter, to wit:

כל המשים על לבו שיעסוק בתורה ולא יעשה מלאכה ויתפרנס מן
הצדקה הרי זה חילל את השם וכו' את התורה...

which stresses the religious significance of combining a gainful occupation with Torah study, condemning at the same time, in no uncertain terms, a way of life which turns the Torah scholar into a recipient of charity.

Whereas the T.I.D.E. school invokes the famous quotation from אם יפה ת"ת עם דרך ארץ: פרקי אבות (פרק ב') It could call attention, in favor of its viewpoint, to the advice contained in לאפיקורם (פרק ג') דע מה שתשיב לאפיקורם (פרק ב'), or in the statement of the Mishnah:

כל שישנו במקרא ובמשנה ובדרך ארץ לא במהרה הוא חוטא וכו'
(קדושין מ')

as well as so many similar sayings of our sages.

The Torah Only school could substantiate its philosophy by quoting from the same פרקי אבות the following statements:

התורה נקנית במיעוט דרך ארץ (פרק ו')
 הוי ממעט בעסק ועסוק בתורה (פרק ד')
 לא כל המרבה במחורה מחכים (פרק ב')
 כל המקבל עליו עול תורה
 מעבירין ממנו... ועול דרך ארץ (פרק ג')

which all postulate the reduction of Derech Erets rather than an ideal to strive for.

Is the Torah scholar allowed or advised to include the "outer wisdoms" into his studies? There is no final answer:

כי היא מחלוקת ישנה בין הראשונים והאחרונים (תשובת הרמ"א סימן י').

No doubt we are dealing with a classical *תיק"ו*, something which must await its final answer when *משיח* comes. He may give the badge of honor to either school, or he may come forth with the verdict: "These and those are words of the living G-d."

Over thirty years ago this writer published a controversial book — many parts of which are still readable, he thinks — a book fully on the Torah Only side.

At that time the satanic forces unleashed by the "Volk der Dichter und Denker" proclaimed loudly the total bankruptcy of Western Kultur, Bildung, Humanism or what have you. The Nazi devilry had only one meaning for the survivors: "go my people come into your chambers, close your doors behind you, withdraw for awhile until the storm be over." Our slogan therefore could then only be: back to the historic Ghetto! back to the Torah Only existence! The Derech Erets which we knew and which we befriended seemed dead forever. How could we know at that time that the historic Ghetto would go up in flames as well? How could we envisage that our Golus path through the "desert of nations" would lead us into the very strongholds of Western civilization?

Surely, little did we know then that the same kind of Western European Golus would come back again, only more so...

Today, all our pre-Nazi problems have come back again as well

as our old Golus sickness; the mutual distrust and the mutual intolerance. Only this time with greater fury and with more vehemence, and with more severe penalties for our inability to cope with them.

Everything in our Jewish world has become more poignant and more pronounced. Eastern and Western Europe are thrown into the same melting pot. Vilna, Warsaw and Frankfurt are housed together in the same street block. And each segment of our people seems to have become the other's bad conscience.

There is an unhealthy absence of self-criticism which is responsible for our conspicuous mediocrity and for our sorry self-righteousness.

Today the timeless problems outlined in the above dialogues beckon for a timely solution. Since there cannot be in our time an authority recognized by all that could give forth an authentic and binding verdict, why may we not suggest a workable synthesis of the differing viewpoints? Why could we not support both schools? *Why should we not emphasize what binds us together rather than what rends us apart?* Why could we not respect the other school's idealism, and demand the same respect for our own? Why could we not support each others efforts, alleviate each others needs and rejoice in each others blessings?

For it seems that one school cannot function without the other. Both should complement each other rather than compete with one another to reach a goal which otherwise must remain onesided, whether we like it or not.

Giving freely to each other does not mean giving *in* to each other.

Both schools of thought could only benefit from such harmony without yielding to the other their basic principles and their traditional philosophies. Why not encourage each opponent to remain true to his heritage, to enhance its values, to correct its shortcomings, if it needs be, and to learn from the other that which could be valuable to his own advancement without yielding one inch of his own ground?

T.I.D.E. and Torah Only need each other for their mutual

interests. Both systems belong to כלל ישראל, each filling in the very gap which the other leaves open.

The lasting values which both contribute to the advancement of Torah life will eventually merge together naturally — like two drops of mercury — into the divinely willed unity of G-d's people.

Now the practical question which we outlined in the first chapter of this treatise:

What shall the Jewish youth do? Which way should they go?

The answer for those who are privileged to be heirs of a definite tradition is not difficult, for their road is clearly outlined. It is to follow the path of their fathers מנהג אבותיהם בידיהם.

But all the others are in need of serious soul searching. Do you just mean to imitate, or to jump on anybody's band-wagon? Do you just mean to ride on the crest of a wave which may go downward as suddenly as it went up? Or do you honestly and sincerely seek to live up to what your Creator expects of you? Do you intend to give to the school to which you shall belong all you have got, your youthful zeal, your passionate devotion, your pure intent? Are you aware of the consequences, the risks and the sacrifices?

Then choose — and if you choose לשם שמים only, may G-d be on your side whatever road you travel. With the Torah as your companion you may go *towards* the world or *away* from it, you could never fail!

בכל דרכיך דעהו והוא ישר אורחותיך (משלי ג' ו')

Postscript

1) To the heirs of Western Orthodoxy there is a clear program. The heritage of S. R. Hirsch is your most valued treasure. What inspired parents and grandparents yesterday has become your historic task today. For, he who becomes untrue to his historic heritage does violence to his spiritual self.

But the Hirschean community extends much further than the boundaries of a local K'hilla. In every region of the Jewish world many eager eyes are focused on you. If you fail you would only have yourselves to blame. Contemporary conditions and developments have placed you on a stage where you are called upon to perform in full view of a huge audience.

Your audience is World Jewry.

A great many uncommitted young Jews and Jewesses all over the Jewish world today stand ready to follow you if you follow the trail which S. R. Hirsch has blazed for your fathers.

For this world-wide Hirschean community *there is one road*. There is no dilemma.

2) The earmark of the Hirschean K'hilla is its complete independence, i.e. a clear and fearless non-recognition of any group, institution or organization which is not totally committed to the law of Torah. The loyal disciples of Hirsch, wherever they are called upon to play a leading role, are inspired by their great Teacher's zealotry, by his unyielding consistency while fighting his victorious battles against מינות in whatever form it appeared.

Rabbi Samson R. Hirsch would never give honor to those who dishonored the Torah. He would never pay homage to those who respected the antagonist of the Torah. Let us never forget that the

T.I.D.E. ideology is only *one* aspect of the Hirschean philosophy. It cannot be *separated* from his militant rebellion against the "Jewish Establishment," i.e. the well organized "Jewish" officialdom, the self styled leaders, the non-observant spokesmen, the Torah-less plutocracy and their mass media.

More so, T.I.D.E. is an essential weapon sorely needed in the relentless fight for a self-reliant, self-respecting Torah society. It is an indispensable tool to build up the organized Torah nation and its official representation in the pre-messianic world. To separate the Hirschean battle cry against *מינות* from the T.I.D.E. Weltanschauung is detrimental to both. It turns the former into a sectarian separatism and the latter into an ideological concession.

It is the blending of both aspects which gives the T.I.D.E. principle its true significance.

3) This genuine Hirschean concept of T.I.D.E. — like all timeless ideas — will outlive us. It will survive our children and our children's children. But it must be embraced as an imperative challenge to approximate the maximum and not as a lame excuse for a lukewarm minimum. It is the clarion call to take the Torah out into the world in order to sanctify the Divine Name on earth by whatever we do amongst men.

This mandate must never become a cheap expedient for the lightminded, the easy-going and the pleasure-seeking.

Therefore, let your boat proudly display its banner, without false shame and without apologies!

But, beware of some common misunderstandings:

a) The motto does not have its accent on the *last* word, but on the *first*. It is TORAH — underscored for double emphasis — with Derech Erets.

b) Your leitmotif is neither: Torah *and* Derech Erets — the two are not equal partners — nor must it be twisted around into: Derech Erets plus Torah, i.e. worldliness wearing some kind of Liliputian yarmulka. It is neither a synthesis of Torah with as-

simulation nor a bloodless orthopraxy blended with earth-bound Americanism.

It is none of these.

It is Torah *Im* Derech Erets.

It means: G-d's Torah, in its totality utilizing Derech Erets as the means to bring about the Torah's full realization.

It means: Torah as the Divine nourishment and human Derech Erets as the aromatic ingredient to bring out the Torah's intrinsic flavor to its most perfect bloom.

It means, the Torah's conquest of life and not the Torah's flight from life.

It means, the Torah casting a light into the darkness rather than hiding from the darkness. It means, to apply Torah to the earth and not to divorce it from the earth.

It also means to instigate the historic return to the fold of our lost Jewish "majority." In this respect the horizon of your influence is beyond measure.

The T.I.D.E. school must strive to rear a generation of men and women who will stand ready to sanctify G-d's name, no matter which mundane activities they are engaged in.

Whether toiling in the vineyards of Divine scholarship or in the courtyards of earthly endeavors, all of their actions must clearly bear the imprint of the Torah, its letter as well as its spirit.

4) Wherever Torah schools in the Hirschean tradition might be built, be sure to fortify the students of such Torah institutions with this ideological armor. Indeed, fortify them to an extent that they could absorb the Torah's light also from other sources — if they should so desire — without casting a shadow on their own background and upbringing. If they may wish to drink from other wells of Torah learning as well, according to the dictum: *מרבח ישיבה* *מרבח חכמה* let them merge the new elixir with the living waters which had sustained them during their formative years in their alma mater.

If the one or the other might cross over entirely to the Torah Only side and if this is not done for the sake of imitation, but with a pure heart and for the "sake of Heaven" he shall have your blessings. For you may be hopeful that — as it has happened time and again — those who have gleaned a rich harvest in other fields of Torah wisdom, will be back one day in order to contribute their spiritual acquisitions towards the enrichment of the soil upon which they have grown.

We are confident that in the end no one who is moved purely by לשם שמים motivations will drift away to a point of no return.

To some the T.I.D.E. school, today, may — wrongly — appear like an educational island. But it is an island which cannot afford to remain isolated because normal and healthy young people will refuse to remain isolated. There are indeed many bridges. As long as you are able to indoctrinate your youth with a strong dose of the sacred heritage don't mind the bridges. You cannot wish to prevent your youth from crossing the bridges if they earnestly desire to learn for themselves the variegated and colorful aspects of Torah life elsewhere.

But bridges are made for going *and* coming. Those that go across will gather invaluable experience elsewhere, but they surely could not wish to forego the basic inspiration of their educational home.

Thus, there might always be two-way traffic on those bridges, fro and back to our ideological point of origin.

In conclusion: There are two schools of thought, two שיטות and they are both legitimate.

The T.I.D.E. ideology is the authentic and indispensable partner of the Torah Nation today. Therefore, dare not leave a stone unturned until you shall have secured, with G-d's help, your firm position. You must make gigantic efforts to realize your ambitious goals, forever ready for real sacrifices in behalf of this ideology.

Let us continue as our fathers did, to support joyfully all other

true Torah causes, as well. Even those who have not yet learned to understand us.

Let us smother their objections with אהבת תורה and אהבת ישראל rather than with arguments. One day we shall be admired for our magnanimity and our sincere concern for the *totality* of the Torah Nation.

All Torah conscious Jews work for the same goal. There are various methods and various avenues of approach. They all lead up to the ultimate end:

יתגדל ויתקדש שמויה רבה!

Can this attitude be called: halfheartedness?

Is this a schizophrenic "Halbheit," Or is it an *awareness* of the totality of כלל ישראל?

Didn't we learn, that the fraternity of Torah scholars shall "increase peace in the world?"

Well —

So let it be...

„למען אחי ורעי אדברה נא שלום בך“.

תושלב"ע